



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
HEALTH AND CONSUMERS DIRECTORATE-GENERAL
Directorate F - Food and Veterinary Office

DG(SANCO) 2009-8214 - MR FINAL

FINAL REPORT OF A MISSION

CARRIED OUT IN

CHILE

FROM 30 NOVEMBER TO 10 DECEMBER 2009

IN ORDER TO EVALUATE THE OPERATION OF CONTROLS OVER THE PRODUCTION OF
FRESH MEAT OF DOMESTIC BOVINES, SHEEP, GOATS AND SWINE, DESTINED FOR
EXPORT TO THE EUROPEAN UNION

In response to information provided by the Competent Authority, any factual error noted in the draft report has been corrected; any clarification appears in the form of a footnote.

Executive Summary

The report describes the outcome of a mission carried out by the Food and Veterinary Office (FVO) in Chile from 30 November to 10 December 2009. The objectives of the mission were to evaluate the public health controls in place over the production of fresh meat of domestic bovine, ovine and porcine animals intended for export to the European Union (EU) and to review the certification of these products.

The Competent Authorities (CA) are well organised, sufficient resources have been allocated to ensure the implementation of the control system, the performance of the veterinary services is satisfactory. A comprehensive approval procedure is in place and correctly applied. Supervisory visits took place regularly; reports were available and corrective action was requested and followed-up.

All the establishments visited had structure, layout, equipment, cleaning and disinfection procedures in line with EU requirements. Only minor deficiencies were noticed and in most cases, immediate action was taken. All the establishments visited had traceability systems in place, allowing tracing from individual boxes of meat to individual animals or group of animals. The tracing back to batch of animals and farms of origin was always possible.

The Food Business Operator's (FBO) own checks and Hazard Analysis Critical Control Points (HACCP) system were generally in line with the EU requirements and evidence was seen of its verification during the routine controls in the establishment by the whole team from the Ministry of Agriculture. The "National Pathogen Reduction Programme" for microbiological testing of carcasses is not fully in line with the provisions of Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005. The Competent Authority (CA) are seeking recognition of equivalence.

The ante- and post mortem inspections were carried out to a satisfactory level. However, the method used for trichina testing was not fully in line with Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005.

The general system for official certification is in place and evidence was seen of its satisfactory application.

The specific legislation in place for the registration of holdings, animal identification and movement controls and its application guarantee that only animals fulfilling the specific requirements for export to the EU are used for production export to the EU.

In general, the organisation of the control of the whole chain of production of fresh meat of porcine, bovine, and ovine animals intended for export to the EU is satisfactory. The establishments visited were largely in compliance with the relevant EU requirements. Minor deficiencies were seen in particular concerning the separation between products for the EU and activities not approved for export to EU.

The performance of the veterinary services is satisfactory and provides the guarantees required for export of meat to the EU, with the exception of the method for Trichina testing which was not fully in line with Commission Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005.

Minor weaknesses were identified regarding the database tool for animal identification and their movements. However, improvements in the database software were announced for 2010. In regard to the contamination of porcine meat with dioxins, the appropriate measures have been taken to investigate this and to prevent non-compliant products from being consumed and exported.

A number of recommendations have been made to the CA with a view to addressing the deficiencies identified during the mission.

Table of Contents

1	<u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
2	<u>OBJECTIVES OF THE MISSION</u>	1
3	<u>LEGAL BASIS FOR THE MISSION</u>	1
4	<u>BACKGROUND</u>	2
4.1	<u>HISTORICAL BACKGROUND</u>	2
4.2	<u>PRODUCTION AND TRADE INFORMATION</u>	2
5	<u>FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</u>	3
5.1	<u>LEGISLATION AND COMPETENT AUTHORITIES</u>	3
5.1.1	<u>LEGISLATION</u>	3
5.1.2	<u>COMPETENT AUTHORITIES</u>	5
5.1.3	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	7
5.2	<u>HOLDING REGISTRATION, ANIMAL IDENTIFICATION AND MOVEMENT CONTROLS</u>	7
5.2.1	<u>LEGAL REQUIREMENTS</u>	7
5.2.2	<u>FINDINGS</u>	7
5.2.3	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	8
5.3	<u>APPLICATION OF HYGIENE RULES AT ESTABLISHMENT LEVEL</u>	8
5.3.1	<u>LEGAL REQUIREMENTS</u>	8
5.3.2	<u>FINDINGS</u>	8
5.3.3	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	10
5.4	<u>OFFICIAL CONTROLS AT ESTABLISHMENT LEVEL</u>	11
5.4.1	<u>LEGAL REQUIREMENT</u>	11
5.4.2	<u>FINDINGS</u>	11
5.4.3	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	12
5.5	<u>CERTIFICATION OF MEAT</u>	12
5.5.1	<u>LEGAL REQUIREMENTS</u>	12
5.5.2	<u>FINDINGS</u>	12
5.5.3	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	13
5.6	<u>MISCELLANEOUS</u>	13
5.6.1	<u>FOLLOW-UP OF DIOXINE RESIDUE IN PORCINE MEAT</u>	13
5.6.2	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	14
6	<u>OVERALL CONCLUSIONS</u>	14
7	<u>CLOSING MEETING</u>	14
8	<u>RECOMMENDATIONS</u>	14
	<u>ANNEX 1 - LEGAL REFERENCES</u>	16

ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS USED IN THIS REPORT

Abbreviation	Explanation
CA	Competent authority
CCA	Central Competent Authority
EU	European Union
FBO	Food Business Operator
FVO	Food and Veterinary Office
HACCP	Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points
OV	Official Veterinarian
PABCO	<i>Planteles de Animales Bajo Certificación Oficial</i> (Animal Premises under Official Certification)
SAG	<i>Servicio Agrícola y Ganadero</i> (Agriculture and Livestock Service)

1 INTRODUCTION

The mission took place in Chile from 30 November to 10 December 2009 as part of the planned mission programme of the FVO. The mission team comprised 2 inspectors from the FVO.

The mission team was accompanied during the mission by representatives from the central competent authority (CCA), the Agriculture and Livestock Service (SAG) of the Ministry of Agriculture.

The opening meeting was held on 30 November 2009 with the CCA in Santiago. At this meeting the inspection team confirmed the objectives of, and itinerary for the mission, and additional information required for the satisfactory completion of the mission was requested.

2 OBJECTIVES OF THE MISSION

The objective of the mission was to evaluate the measures taken by the Chilean authorities to provide adequate guarantees for export of fresh meat, intended for export to the EU, taking into account the conclusions and recommendations of previous FVO mission reports, in particular report DG(SANCO)/9198/2003 (hereafter referred to as the previous mission). This report is available on the Health and Consumer Protection Directorate General web-site at http://ec.europa.eu/food/fvo/index_en.cfm.

The mission team assessed in particular:

1. the certification of animals and meat in relation to the requirements of Council Directive 96/93/EC;
2. the controls in place over the production of fresh meat of bovine, ovine and porcine animals, intended for export to EU, in relation to the requirements of Council Decision 79/542//EEC.

In pursuit of these objectives, the following sites were visited:

Visits		Comments
Competent Authorities		
Central	√	Initial and final meeting
Zonal	1	Regional Office
Local	√	During visits in establishments
Databases	√	During visits in establishments and office
Animal holdings	3	Two approved for EU, one not EU approved
Establishments	6	One cold store, slaughterhouses/cutting plants for pigs(2), for bovine (1), combined ovine-bovine (2)

3 LEGAL BASIS FOR THE MISSION

The mission was carried out in agreement with the Chilean Authorities and under the general

provisions of:

The general provisions of the Agreement on Sanitary and Phytosanitary measures applicable to trade in animals and animal products, plants, plant products and other goods and animal welfare - hereafter Agreement - (Annex IV of the Association Agreement between the European Community and its Member States of the one part and the Republic of Chile of the other part). The Association Agreement was approved by the Community with Council Decision 2005/269/EC in February 2005.

Community legislation and, in particular:

- Article 46 of Regulation (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 on official controls performed to ensure the verification of compliance with feed and food law, animal health and animal welfare rules.
- Appendix VII of the Agreement (Guidelines for conducting verifications).

A full list of the legal instruments referred to in this report is provided in Annex 1. Legal acts quoted in this report refer, where applicable, to the last amended version.

4 BACKGROUND

4.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Chile is included in the list of third countries (TCs) from which the Member States authorize imports of fresh meat of bovine, ovine, porcine animals as laid down in Part 1 of Annex II to Council Decision 79/542/EEC.

Article 8(1) of the Agreement stipulates that for products of animal origin the import conditions of the importing Party shall be applicable to the total territory of the exporting Party.

There has been a notification in Rapid Alert System for Food and Feed (RASFF) linked to dioxin residues in porcine meat from Chile in 2008.

4.2 PRODUCTION AND TRADE INFORMATION

Pork meat industry

Pork meat production is mainly located in the central regions of Chile. Valparaiso, O'Higgins, Maule and Metropolitan are regions where the majority of the commercial pig farms are concentrated.

All export companies are vertically integrated. The national pork meat industry has 46 companies with a total of 207 000 herds, where the companies vary in size from large (5) to medium (13) to small (28).

During the year 2008 the total production was 1 394 000 tonnes of meat carcasses of which 37.5% corresponded to pork meat. In the year 2008, 522 000 tonnes of pork meat carcasses was produced and the average annual production has raised approximately 8.3%.

At present, 64% of Chilean pork meat production is trading on the domestic market and the industry expects to balance domestic and export markets during the coming years.

Bovine meat industry

According to figures from 2007, there are 3 789 697 bovine animals in Chile, mainly concentrated in the Southern part of the country, Los Lagos, La Araucanía and Los Ríos regions.

This sector has a horizontal structure, where animal suppliers are thousands of producers (farmers) of all sizes and all regions of the country. This production is concentrated between the regions of the Bío Bío to the Aysén. Although in recent years the breeding and fattening has moved from the Metropolitan Region to the south, the meat industry remains concentrated in the central zone and the Metropolitan Region.

In 2008, 240 257 carcasses of bovine meat were produced in Chile.

Ovine Meat Industry

The main production is concentrated in the southern part, Patagonia.

5 FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

5.1 LEGISLATION AND COMPETENT AUTHORITIES

Legal Basis:

Article 46 of Regulation (EC) No 882/2004 stipulates that Community Controls in third countries shall verify compliance or equivalence of third-country legislation and systems with Community feed and food law and Community animal health legislation. These controls shall have particular regard to the points set out in a) - e) of the aforementioned article.

Point 1.2 of the Appendix VII to the Agreement outlines that verification should be designed to check the effectiveness of the auditee.

5.1.1 Legislation

5.1.1.1 Legal requirements

Art. 8(1) of the Agreement stipulates that for the products of animal origin the import conditions of importing Party shall be applicable to the total territory of the exporting Party.

5.1.1.2 Findings

The following relevant national laws, regulations and administrative provisions are considered by the CCA to provide guarantees equivalent to the following Community legislation:

COMMUNITY LEGISLATION		NATIONAL LEGISLATION/STANDARD
Directive 98/83/EC	Quality of water for human consumption	Supreme decree 977 Supreme decree 131 Supreme decree 735 Chilean Standard NCh 409/1.Of2005
Directive 2000/13/EC	Labelling of foodstuffs	Supreme decree 977 Supreme decree 239

Regulation (EC) No 178/2002	General Food law	Decree with Force Law 725 Law 19.162 Supreme decree 977 Decree with Force Law 307 and Resolutions 557, 1992, 2487, 5580, 725 for feed.
Regulation (EC) No 852/2004	Hygiene of foodstuffs	Law 19162 Supreme decree 977 Chilean Standard NCh 2861.Of2004
Regulation (EC) No 853/2004	Hygiene of food of animal origin, in particular Annexes I, II and III (sections II, V and VI)	Law 19162 Supreme decree 977 Resolution 2592 Resolution 3772, PABCO Resolution 6644, PABCO Resolution 6286 (EU list) Resolution 4643, Porcine Resolution 359, Bovine Resolution 3902, Ovine
Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005	Microbiological criteria for foodstuffs	Supreme decree 977 Resolution 2592
Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005	Official controls for <i>Trichinella</i> in meat.	Standard 62

Observations:

The FVO audit team identified the following difference between the Chilean legislation and the requirements of the Community legislation governing fresh meat:

- The "National Pathogen Reduction Programme" microbiological carcass testing is not covering all the same organisms and the same procedure as included in Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005:

	Bovine	Porcine	Ovine
Salmonella spp.	5 weekly samples before chilling using the non-destructive method	5 weekly samples before chilling using the non-destructive method	5 weekly samples before chilling using the non-destructive method
E. Coli	1 sample every 300 carcasses, after chilling using the non-destructive method	1 sample every 1000 carcasses, after chilling using the non-destructive method	5 sample every week, after chilling using the non-destructive method

Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005 requires weekly testing of 5 carcasses of all species before chilling for Aerobic colony count, Enterobacteriaceae and Salmonella. The destructive and non-destructive sampling methods, the selection of the sampling sites and the rules for storage and transport of samples are described in standard ISO 17604.

- The CCA are seeking recognition of equivalence of the "National Pathogen Reduction

Programme” with EU requirements.

5.1.2 *Competent Authorities*

5.1.2.1 *Legal requirements*

Article 46 of Regulation (EC) No 882/2004 specifies that official controls carried out in TCs by Commission experts shall have particular regard to the organisation of the TC's CAs, their powers and independence. This Article also refers to other issues such as the training of staff in the performance of official controls, the existence and operation of documented control procedures and control systems based on priorities.

Article 5 of the Agreement defines the responsible authorities as follows:

1. The CAs of the Parties are the authorities competent for the implementation of the measures referred to in this Agreement, as provided for in Appendix II., namely the Ministry of Agriculture through the “ *Servicio Agrícola y Ganadero* ”.
2. The Parties shall, in accordance with Article 12, inform each other of any significant changes in the structure, organisation and division of competency of their CAs.

Point 4(d) of Part B of Appendix V to the Agreement outlines that the verification concerns the structure and organisation of the CA as well as the powers available regarding the implementation of importing Party's rules.

5.1.2.2 *Findings*

5.1.2.2.1 *Organisation and co-ordination of Competent Authorities*

The organization of the CA remains as described in the previous report except that the SAG has taken over responsibility from the Ministry of Public Health for ante and post-mortem inspection in exporting plants.

The official meat inspection in all the establishments authorized to export is made by SAG inspectors, since the Ministry of Health delegated meat inspection in these types of establishments through an Agreement. Inspection procedures are based on regulations determined by the Ministry of Health, Standard 62, in addition, specific requirements for export to foreign countries where the establishments are authorized to export are applied. Furthermore, the official inspection team supervises programmes to control clean-up and disinfection of work surfaces and equipment implemented by the company, through on-site verifications of sampling, training company monitors, and preparing verification worksheets for the company's microbiological monitoring plan, in accordance with the official procedures.

Meat inspection procedures in slaughter establishments are comprised of veterinarian officers and technicians in the livestock area (assistants). Staffing numbers are determined by the SAG in accordance with the complexity of the plant, and whose leader will be Head of the Team. The work team have to carry out the Sanitary Inspection of Meats and Working Order and Structure of the plant, pursuant to prevailing regulation and verification of the Auto-Control System.

5.1.2.2.2 Competent Authorities, powers, independence and authority for enforcement

There is a system in place to allow the implementation and enforcement of the requirements in regard to the production and certification of meat to EU.

5.1.2.2.3 Supervision and Audits

Audits of the regions are carried out by central level on an annual basis. They include the evaluation of the performance at 3 levels: the Regional staff, the sectoral level and the local team working in the establishments. In general at least one export establishment is included in the audit.

The central level has not yet carried out all the scheduled audits for this year .

5.1.2.2.4 Staff performing official controls

With no exception, the staff met during the mission showed a high level of knowledge and interest in their work.

Only the SAG official staff are involved in the control in establishments and certification. Official tasks are not carried out by company auxiliaries. Accredited veterinarians carry out controls on farms under the “*Programma de Planteles Animales bajo Certification Oficial (PABCO)*” , with the exception of the Magallanes Region, where the SAG is solely involved (see also point 5.2.2).

5.1.2.2.5 Resources

Sufficient resources have been deployed to ensure the implementation of the system of controls in relation to the export of meat to the EU.

5.1.2.2.6 Organisation of official controls

The different levels or strata of the SAG register, supervise and monitor the establishments approved to export to the EU and the certification of their products.

Evidence was seen that instructions and procedures exist to involve all team members in the SAG in the supervision of own checks. Each team member is attributed verification tasks of own-checks in accordance with a rotating work schedule, increasing in this way the involvement of the whole team and their awareness of the requirements.

5.1.2.2.7 Control and verification procedures

Specific legislation is in place to regulate the production for export and its certification.

5.1.2.2.8 Training

Extensive training programmes are in place covering different topics. Attendance lists and content were available.

5.1.3 Conclusion

In general, the organisation of the CAs, their powers and independence, the supervision to which they are subject to, and the authority they have to enforce the applicable legislation effectively is satisfactory. Documented control procedures are in place.

The legislation, the organisation, the training and the operation of the CAs can provide sufficient assurances that the EU requirements for export of meat, are met.

5.2 HOLDING REGISTRATION, ANIMAL IDENTIFICATION AND MOVEMENT CONTROLS

5.2.1 Legal requirements

Points II.2.2, II.2.3 and II.2.4 on the Animal health Attestation of the model certificate “BOV” in part 2 of Annex II to Council Decision 79/542/EEC requires guarantees concerning the origin of the animals, the holdings and the transporting of the animals.

5.2.2 Findings

Specific legislation is put in place to guarantee that animals are fulfilling the specific requirement for export to the EU. The PABCO guarantees that the farms for bovine, porcine and ovine animals, their meat and their products fulfil the sanitary requirements and the good husbandry practices required by the countries of destination. The procedures, instructions and check-lists are made official by Resolución Nos 3772, 359, 4643 and 3902 referred to in point 5.1.1.2.

During their entire lives all animals in the system have to be kept on the PABCO holdings, kept segregated and transported to other PABCO farms and slaughterhouses eligible for export to the EU with appropriate transport documentation. Bovine animals on PABCO farms are eartagged before the age of 6 months, before weaning or before movements. The documentation, status of the farms and the eartags are checked in the slaughterhouses and the information cross-checked with the information kept in the database.

All farms have registration numbers and many farms are in the PABCO system. The PABCO farms are checked every 3 or 6 months, depending on the species, by accredited veterinarians and regularly by SAG officials (once every year or every two years). For the Magallanes Region (Patagonia) slightly different rules are applied, as no accredited veterinarians are involved and it is the SAG that is responsible for carrying out checks twice a year for sheep and four times a year for cattle¹

Observations:

- Bovine animals sold to a non-PABCO farm and through a market lose their traceability in the database and become "floating animals". The information in the database indicates that they are still present on this market.
- Bovine animals can be found at non-PABCO farms with the eartags intact and remain in the database¹.
- On one of the farms visited, an exercise was carried out to remove floating bovine animals

¹ *In their response to the draft report the CA stated that, “we would make the point that cattle with official individual eartags (DIIO) that are moved from a PABCO farm to a non-PABCO farm, or through show grounds to non-PABCO farms, are sometimes recorded in the database as ‘virtual stock’ of the establishment of origin even though they are physically located in the establishment of destination, because the owner of the establishment of destination does not inform the SAG that he has received the moved animals”.*

from the database.

- On another bovine farm for extensive breeding, the data kept was available but not in a way that allowed easy auditing and verification, for example, no holding register in the template suggested in the PABCO requirements.
- The mission team was informed that the actual database has few verification tools built in and that the SAG is developing a new database with tools for verifying the traceability of animals, which will allow information on animal movements to be entered directly by producers, under the supervision of official veterinarians.
- In one slaughterhouse receiving animals from PABCO and non-PABCO farms, a SAG person was present checking the validity of the information on the "Formulario sanitaria de movimiento animal" (signed by the farmer) containing the eartags of each bovine. It is not uncommon that discrepancies are noticed and confirmation/clarification is then requested.
- Some delays of up to one week are seen between the transport and the registration of transports in the database.

5.2.3 Conclusion

Registration of holdings and identification of cattle and sheep were in line with the Chilean standards and provide the guarantees required by Council Decision 79/542/EEC. Minor weaknesses were identified regarding the database tool for animal identification and their movements. However, improvements in the database software were announced for 2010.

5.3 APPLICATION OF HYGIENE RULES AT ESTABLISHMENT LEVEL

5.3.1 Legal requirements

According to Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 854/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004, products of animal origin may be imported into the Community only if they have been dispatched from, and obtained or prepared in, listed establishments for which the CA of the third country of origin guarantees that they comply with the relevant Community requirements, in particular those of Regulation (EC) No 853/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004, or with requirements that were determined to be equivalent to such requirements.

In addition, point II.1 (public health attestation) of the export certificate for meat laid down by Council Decision 79/542/EEC requires meat to be produced in accordance with the relevant requirements of Regulations (EC) No 178/2002, No 852/2004, No 853/2004, No 854/2004 and additionally (EC) No 999/2001 for bovine and ovine animals, and No 2075/2005 for porcine animals.

5.3.2 Findings

5.3.2.1 Approval procedures

A comprehensive approval procedure is laid down in the Regulation on the administration of sanitary registration and enrolment for establishments of food for export is in place and is applied. In all establishments visited, where the procedure was checked by the mission team, the different steps of the approval procedure were followed and elaborate checklists are used. In addition,

evidence was seen that the approval is re-evaluated and renewed every year. The procedure foresees that, when a company has not exported to any market for 24 months, the export licence is withdrawn which implicitly includes the withdrawal of the approval for export to the EU.

5.3.2.2 *General hygiene requirements*

Observations:

All the establishments visited had structure, layout, equipment, cleaning and disinfection procedures in line with EU requirements. Only some limited deficiencies were noticed, and in some cases, immediate action was taken. These deficiencies were:

- The maintenance was insufficient in 2 establishments: damaged freezing tunnels and storage rooms for frozen packed products.
- Splitting saw not sterilised between each animal, leading to cross-contamination.
- Heads touching platform in one pig slaughterhouse, bovine carcasses touching wall in chiller in one slaughterhouse.
- Handheld hoses at post-mortem stand, leading to cross-contamination.
- Splashing during carcass wash, causing cross-contamination.
- Lid of water tank not hermetically sealed.
- Condensation and infiltration in adjacent chiller due to insufficient separation and isolation between 2 chillers with different cooling conditions.
- Insufficient separation between packing and cutting room (only partition), leading to cross-contamination.
- Spraying of acetic acid with exposed product nearby.
- One knife technique used for bleeding in one slaughterhouse, causing some cross-contamination.

5.3.2.3 *Specific requirements*

The specific requirements were in line with the EU in all the establishments visited, however some limited deficiencies were observed:

Observations:

- The tonsils were not removed after post-mortem inspection.
- Absence of apron wash cabins in 2 slaughterhouses: the operators could not clean themselves in a satisfactory way and could re-contaminate the carcasses.

5.3.2.4 *HACCP-based systems*

The FBO own checks were generally in line with the EU requirements and HACCP programmes were in place.

The "National Pathogen Reduction Programme" for microbiological carcass testing is replacing the obligation of the FBO to test the carcasses; however it does not cover completely the same organisms as included in Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005. (see also 5.1.1)

5.3.2.5 *Separation of EU/non-EU eligible animals and products*

Observations:

- In 3 establishments the separation of EU and non-EU eligible meat was not satisfactory:
 - in one pig slaughterhouse meat, after cleaning, was stored in non-identified containers.
 - in one sheep slaughterhouse there was insufficient separation between products stored for EU export, for the domestic market, and expired products.
 - In one slaughterhouse the procedure described for separation of EU eligible meat was not followed and immediately a non-compliance report was issued.

5.3.2.6 *Traceability, identification marking and labelling*

The documents accompanying the animals at arrival allowing traceability to the farm of origin are the “*Guía de Tránsito de Animales*” (municipal), the “*Guía de Despacho*” (fiscal), the “*Formulario Sanitario de Movimiento de Animales*” (signed by the farmer) containing the eartags of each bovine species and the form “*Origen y Destino*” for ovine species’

All the establishments visited had traceability systems in place, often allowing to trace from individual boxes of meat to individual animals or groups of animals. The tracing back to batch of animals and farms of origin was always possible. In all establishments visited, the meat destined for the EU market was identified and labelled in accordance with the EU requirements, with one exception, and produced and stored separately. All the establishments visited had a traceability system in place and the FVO mission team carried out some conclusive traceability exercises.

Observations:

- In one establishment, the information concerning beef labelling was not on the labels: the “country of origin Chile” was not mentioned on the label when the animals were born, raised and slaughtered in Chile as required by Regulation (EC) No 1760/2000 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 July 2000.

5.3.3 *Conclusion*

A comprehensive approval procedure is put in place and correctly applied. The establishments visited were largely in compliance with the relevant EU requirements. The general and specific requirements for establishments were, with some isolated and mainly minor deficiencies, met. The Food Business Operator's (FBO) own checks and HACCP system were generally in line with the EU requirements. The internal traceability was satisfactory and it was possible to trace back to the farm of origin.

The "National Pathogen Reduction Programme" microbiological carcass testing does not cover all the same organisms as included in Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005. Minor deficiencies were seen in particular concerning the separation between products for the EU and activities not approved for export to the EU.

5.4 OFFICIAL CONTROLS AT ESTABLISHMENT LEVEL

5.4.1 *Legal requirement*

Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 854/2004 lays down that the CA of the third country of origin has to guarantee that establishments placed on the list of establishments from which imports of specified products of animal origin to the EU are permitted, together with any establishments handling raw material of animal origin used in the manufacture of the products of animal origin concerned, complies with the relevant Community requirements, in particular those of Regulation (EC) No 853/2004, or with the requirements that were determined to be equivalent and that an official inspection service supervises the establishments and has real powers to stop the establishments from exporting to the Community in the event that the establishments fail to meet the relevant requirements.

Article 9 of the Agreement lays down requirements for certification procedures.

5.4.2 *Findings*

5.4.2.1 *Ante-mortem and post-mortem inspection*

Observations:

- In all slaughterhouses visited, the ante-mortem inspection was carried out, as required and well documented. The documents for the transport of live animals contained all the food chain information.
- Post-mortem inspection was carried out by the trained staff of the SAG under the supervision of the OV and in general performed very well. However, in one establishment slaughtering 500 pigs per hour, the veterinary staff could not carry out in a satisfactory way all the required visual inspections and palpations due to the high speed of the slaughter line.
- The Chilean national requirements concerning Trichina testing are not fully in line with Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005, although this is certified on the export certificate. For example, in one slaughterhouse, 2 small petrie dishes and a stereomicroscope without the correct magnification (60-100 X in the case of suspicion) was used. In another slaughterhouse, the sample numbers differed from the slaughter numbers in one establishment. There was only one number in the difference, however it had not been noticed.

5.4.2.2 *Health marking*

Since the previous FVO mission in 2003, 2 types of ink are used: Brilliant blue for EU eligible animals and blue for non-EU eligible animals. A brown ink is used for the health marking of ovine carcasses. No problems in relation to health marking were identified by the mission team.

5.4.2.3 *Verification of food business operator's compliance*

Evidence was seen of the verification during the routine controls in the establishments by

the different members of the SAG team and they were in line with the planned arrangements. No major problems were identified by the FVO mission team. The minor deficiencies identified by the mission team had not been identified by the CA.

5.4.2.4 Actions in case of non-compliance

Evidence was seen that non-compliance notes are issued, corrective measures are requested and reviewed at the latest during the next month's supervision.

5.4.2.5 Animal welfare at the time of slaughter

No problems were identified by the FVO mission team.

5.4.3 Conclusion

The official controls were carried out at a satisfactory level. Supervisory visits took place regularly; reports were available and corrective action was requested and followed-up. The method for Trichina testing was not fully in line with Commission Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005.

General and specific hygiene requirements were met in all establishments visited, however, some minor deficiencies were noted by the mission team that had not been identified by the CA.

Official inspection tasks were carried out in line with the provisions of Regulation (EC) No 854/2004 and no deficiencies in relation to animal welfare at the time of slaughter were identified.

5.5 CERTIFICATION OF MEAT

5.5.1 Legal requirements:

Art. 9 of the Agreement establishes that for purposes of certification procedures the Parties shall comply with the principles and criteria set out in Appendix IX. The models of the health certificates for imports of fresh meat into the EU are laid down in Council Decision 79/542/EEC.

5.5.2 Findings

The general system for official certification is in place and evidence was seen of its application. The OV from the SAG has a list of underlying documents to be checked before signing and the underlying documentation was always available allowing the OV to certify all the statements included in the certificate. In all the cases checked the certification procedure was complied with and physical checks are carried out at loading.

A bilateral agreement with Sweden exists concerning the Salmonella testing of ovine meat.

Observations:

However, the mission team found that:

- Shipments are leaving the establishment without the certificates being issued, and the certificates are issued on the date that the test results for Salmonella are available. However the consignments are only released at the port of exit once the certificates were issued.
- The system allows that replacement certificates are issued in cases where the OV is able to recuperate all copies of the initial certificate. However in one case checked replacement certificates had been issued twice: first after a change of customer, the second time when Salmonella results were available. The information concerning this issue was not available in the establishment but was clarified to the mission team after contact with the local veterinary office.
- Some misunderstandings occurred concerning the "place of origin" mentioned in the certificate. In one coldstore, products were certified by the OV of this coldstore mentioning the establishment of production as the place of origin of the consignment. It was explained that it is the last place or establishment from where the goods are loaded, checked and certified.

5.5.3 Conclusion

The general system for official certification is in place and evidence was seen of its satisfactory application. In all the cases checked the certification procedure was complied with and based on the verification of the underlying documentation that allows the OV to certify all the statements included in the certificate.

5.6 MISCELLANEOUS

5.6.1 Follow-up of dioxine residue in porcine meat:

Following the official notification by the South Korean Authorities (3 July 2008) of the contamination of porcine meat with dioxine, the following procedure was applied:

- suspension of the certification
- evaluation of the impact and investigation of the cause
- evaluation of the causes and the corrective measures
- reinforcement of the requirements and the surveillance and monitoring programme

The outcome of the comprehensive investigation was that 19 export farms (PABCO) were identified with dioxins violations, representing 7.5% of the fattening animals; export from these farms was suspended. A residue of "Zinc oxide" deriving from a metallurgic company was identified as the principal source for the contamination. It should have been disposed off instead of being used in feed.

The corrective measures included suspension of the use of zinc oxide, implementation of new legal requirements, retention and recuperation of all probably contaminated products, destruction of contaminated products.

A surveillance programme has been put in place in all establishments that export porcine meat. In total 235 samples of porcine meat have been analysed and all results were below the maximum residue level. In addition a monitoring programme has been put in place in the second semester of

2009 (330 samples in several species and 200 in feed). 61% of the results of the monitoring programme were available and were below the maximum residue level.

5.6.2 Conclusion

The CA have carried out a comprehensive investigation, taken the appropriate measures to avoid further contamination and to prevent non-compliant products being exported, and continue to monitor the different commodities.

6 OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

In general, the organisation of the control of the whole chain of production of fresh meat of porcine, bovine, and ovine animals intended for export to the EU is satisfactory. The establishments visited were largely in compliance with the relevant EU requirements. Minor deficiencies were seen in particular concerning the separation between products for the EU and activities not approved for export.

The "National Pathogens Reducing Programme" for microbiological testing of carcasses is not in line with the provisions of Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005.

The performance of the veterinary services is satisfactory and provides the guarantees required for export of meat to the EU, with the exception of the method for Trichina testing which was not fully in compliance with Commission Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005.

Minor weaknesses were identified regarding the database tool for animal identification and their movements. However, improvements of the database software were announced for 2010.

The CA, in regard to the contamination of porcine meat with dioxins, has taken the appropriate measures to investigate the incident and to prevent the export or placing on the market of non-compliant products.

7 CLOSING MEETING

A closing meeting was held on 10 December 2009 with the representatives of the CCA, during which the mission team presented its initial findings. The CCA did not express disagreement with these.

8 RECOMMENDATIONS

An action plan describing the action taken or planned in response to the recommendations of this report and setting out a time table, and a description of the actions taken to correct the deficiencies found should be presented to the Commission within 25 working days of receipt of the report.

N°.	Recommendation
1.	The Competent Authority should consider addressing the weaknesses in the database tool for bovine animal identification and their movements to ensure that the

N°.	Recommendation
	requirements of Council Decision 79/542/EEC in relation to bovine meat can be met.
2.	The Competent Authority should fulfil the requirements concerning microbiological carcass testing in accordance with Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005.
3.	The Competent Authority should ensure that the porcine meat fulfils the requirements of Commission Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005, in particular concerning the method for Trichina testing, as required in point II.1.3 on the Public health Attestation of the model certificate “POR” in part 2 of Annex II to Council Decision 79/542/EEC.

The competent authority's response to the recommendations can be found at:

http://ec.europa.eu/food/fvo/ap/ap_cl_2009-8214.pdf

ANNEX 1 - LEGAL REFERENCES

Legal Reference	Official Journal	Title
Dec. 79/542/EEC	OJ L 146, 14.6.1979, p. 15-17	79/542/EEC: Council Decision of 21 December 1976 drawing up a list of third countries from which the Member States authorize imports of bovine animals, swine and fresh meat
Reg. 178/2002	OJ L 31, 1.2.2002, p. 1-24	Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety
Reg. 1760/2000	OJ L 204, 11.8.2000, p. 1-10	Regulation (EC) No 1760/2000 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 July 2000 establishing a system for the identification and registration of bovine animals and regarding the labelling of beef and beef products and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 820/97
Reg. 1825/2000	OJ L 216, 26.8.2000, p. 8-12	Commission Regulation (EC) No 1825/2000 of 25 August 2000 laying down detailed rules for the application of Regulation (EC) No 1760/2000 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the labelling of beef and beef products
Reg. 999/2001	OJ L 147, 31.5.2001, p. 1-40	Regulation (EC) No 999/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 May 2001 laying down rules for the prevention, control and eradication of certain transmissible spongiform encephalopathies
Reg. 852/2004	OJ L 139, 30.4.2004, p. 1, Corrected and re-published in OJ L 226, 25.6.2004, p. 3	Regulation (EC) No 852/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 on the hygiene of foodstuffs
Reg. 853/2004	OJ L 139, 30.4.2004, p. 55, Corrected and re-published in OJ L 226, 25.6.2004, p. 22	Regulation (EC) No 853/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 laying down specific hygiene rules for food of animal origin

Legal Reference	Official Journal	Title
Reg. 854/2004	OJ L 139, 30.4.2004, p. 206, Corrected and re-published in OJ L 226, 25.6.2004, p. 83	Regulation (EC) No 854/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 laying down specific rules for the organisation of official controls on products of animal origin intended for human consumption
Reg. 882/2004	OJ L 165, 30.4.2004, p. 1, Corrected and re-published in OJ L 191, 28.5.2004, p. 1	Regulation (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 on official controls performed to ensure the verification of compliance with feed and food law, animal health and animal welfare rules
Reg. 2073/2005	OJ L 338, 22.12.2005, p. 1-26	Commission Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005 of 15 November 2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs
Reg. 2074/2005	OJ L 338, 22.12.2005, p. 27-59	Commission Regulation (EC) No 2074/2005 of 5 December 2005 laying down implementing measures for certain products under Regulation (EC) No 853/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council and for the organisation of official controls under Regulation (EC) No 854/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Regulation (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council, derogating from Regulation (EC) No 852/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council and amending Regulations (EC) No 853/2004 and (EC) No 854/2004
Reg. 2075/2005	OJ L 338, 22.12.2005, p. 60-82	Commission Regulation (EC) No 2075/2005 of 5 December 2005 laying down specific rules on official controls for Trichinella in meat
Reg. 2076/2005	OJ L 338, 22.12.2005, p. 83-88	Commission Regulation (EC) No 2076/2005 of 5 December 2005 laying down transitional arrangements for the implementation of Regulations (EC) No 853/2004, (EC) No 854/2004 and (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council and amending Regulations (EC) No 853/2004 and (EC) No 854/2004
Dir. 93/119/EC	OJ L 340, 31.12.1993, p. 21-34	Council Directive 93/119/EC of 22 December 1993 on the protection of animals at the time of slaughter

Legal Reference	Official Journal	Title
		or killing
Dir. 96/23/EC	OJ L 125, 23.5.1996, p. 10-32	Council Directive 96/23/EC of 29 April 1996 on measures to monitor certain substances and residues thereof in live animals and animal products and repealing Directives 85/358/EEC and 86/469/EEC and Decisions 89/187/EEC and 91/664/EEC
Dir. 96/93/EC	OJ L 13, 16.1.1997, p. 28-30	Council Directive 96/93/EC of 17 December 1996 on the certification of animals and animal products
Dir. 98/83/EC	OJ L 330, 5.12.1998, p. 32-54	Council Directive 98/83/EC of 3 November 1998 on the quality of water intended for human consumption
Dir. 2000/13/EC	OJ L 109, 6.5.2000, p. 29-42	Directive 2000/13/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 March 2000 on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the labelling, presentation and advertising of foodstuffs
Dir. 2002/99/EC	OJ L 18, 23.1.2003, p. 11-20	Council Directive 2002/99/EC of 16 December 2002 laying down the animal health rules governing the production, processing, distribution and introduction of products of animal origin for human consumption
Dec. 98/140/EC	OJ L 38, 12.2.1998, p. 14-16	98/140/EC: Commission Decision of 4 February 1998 laying down certain detailed rules concerning on-the-spot checks carried out in the veterinary field by Commission experts in third countries
Dec. 2004/432/EC	OJ L 154, 30.4.2004, p. 44-50, corrected and re-published in OJ L 189, 27.5.2004, p. 33	2004/432/EC: Commission Decision of 29 April 2004 on the approval of residue monitoring plans submitted by third countries in accordance with Council Directive 96/23/EC
Dec. 2007/777/EC	OJ L 312, 30.11.2007, p. 49-67	2007/777/EC: Commission Decision of 29 November 2007 laying down the animal and public health conditions and model certificates for imports of certain meat products and treated stomachs, bladders and intestines for human consumption

Legal Reference	Official Journal	Title
		from third countries and repealing Decision 2005/432/EC
Dec. 2005/269/EC	OJ L 84, 2.4.2005, p. 19-20	2005/269/EC: Council Decision of 28 February 2005 on the conclusion of the Agreement establishing an association between the European Community and its Member States of the one part, and the Republic of Chile, of the other part